Contents

Foreword by Vassilios Skouris, President of the Court of Justice of the European Union v
Editors' Preface vii
List of Contributors xxxix

Part I – Commentary on the Articles of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights

Article 1 – Human Dignity 3
Catherine Dupré

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 1 3
Select Bibliography 3

A. Article 1 and the Scope of EU Law 4
B. Interrelationship of Article 1 with Other Provisions of the Charter 6
C. Sources of Article 1 8
  I. ECHR 8
  II. Council of Europe Treaties 9
  III. UN Treaties 10
  IV. Relevant EU Law 11
  V. Other Sources: National Constitutions 11
D. Analysis 13
  I. General Remarks 13
  II. Scope of Application 15
  III. Specific Provisions 18
  IV. Limitations and Derogations 21
  V. Remedies 23
E. Evaluation 24

Article 2 – Right to Life 25
Elizabeth Wicks

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 2 25
Select Bibliography 25

A. Field of Application of Article 2 26
B. Interrelationship of Article 2 with Other Provisions of the Charter 27
C. Sources of Article 2 Rights 29
  I. ECHR 29
  II. UN Treaties 30
  III. Other Sources 30

D. Analysis 31
I. General Remarks 31
II. Scope of Application 31
III. Specific Provisions 33
IV. Limitations and Derogations 36
V. Remedies 37
E. Evaluation 38

Article 3 – Right to the Integrity of the Person 39
Sabine Michalowski

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 3 39
Select Bibliography 39

A. Field of Application of Article 3 40
B. Interrelationship of Article 3 with Other Provisions of the Charter 42
C. Sources of Article 3 Rights 43
I. ECHR 43
II. UN Treaties 43
III. Council of Europe Treaties 43
D. Analysis 44
I. General Remarks 44
II. Scope of Application 45
III. Specific Provisions 46
IV. Limitations and Derogations 57
V. Remedies 58
E. Evaluation 58

Article 4 – Prohibition of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment 61
Manfred Nowak and Anne Charbord

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 4 61
Select Bibliography 61

A. Field of Application of Article 4 63
B. Interrelationship of Article 4 with Other Provisions of the Charter 67
C. Sources of Article 4 Rights 70
I. ECHR 70
II. UN Treaties 71
III. Council of Europe Treaties 74
D. Analysis 74
I. General Remarks 74
II. Scope of Application 76
III. Specific Provisions 80
IV. Limitations and Derogations 92
V. Remedies 95
E. Evaluation 97

Article 5 – Prohibition of Slavery and Forced Labour **101**
Heli Askola

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 5 101
Select Bibliography 102

A. Field of Application of Article 5 103
B. Interrelationship of Article 5 with Other Provisions of the Charter 104
C. Sources of Rights under Article 5 105
D. Analysis 106
  I. General Remarks 106
  II. Scope of Application 107
  III. Specific Provisions 108
  IV. Limitations and Derogations 117
  V. Remedies 118

Article 6 – Right to Liberty and Security **121**
Daniel Wilsher

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 6 121
Select Bibliography 122

A. Field of Application of Article 6 122
B. Interrelationship of Article 6 with Other Provisions of the Charter 125
C. Sources of Article 6 Rights 126
  I. ECHR 126
  II. UN Treaties 126
  III. Council of Europe Treaties 127
  IV. Other Sources 128
D. Analysis 128
  I. General Remarks 128
  II. Scope of Application 129
  III. Specific Provisions 131
  IV. Limitations and Derogations 132
  V. Remedies 150
E. Evaluation 150

Article 7 – Respect for Private and Family Life (Private Life, Home and Communications) **153**
Jens Vested-Hansen

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 7 153
Select Bibliography 153

A. Field of Application of Article 7 (Private Life, Home and Communications) 154
B. Interrelationship of Article 7 with Other Provisions of the Charter 154
C. Sources of Article 7 Rights 155

D. Analysis 155
I. General Remarks 155
II. Scope of Application 155
III. Specific Provisions 161
IV. Limitations and Derogations 179
V. Remedies 180
E. Evaluation 181

Article 7 – Right to Respect for Private and Family Life (Family Life Aspects) 183
Shazia Choudhry

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 7 183
Select Bibliography 183

A. Field of Application of Article 7 183
I. Gender Equality 184
II. Children's Rights 187
III. Free Movement, Immigration and Asylum 190
B. Interrelationship of Article 7 with Other Provisions of the Charter 193
C. Sources of Article 7 Rights 194
I. ECHR 194
II. Council of Europe Treaties 195
III. UN Treaties 198
D. Analysis 201
I. General Remarks 201
II. Scope of Application 202
III. Specific Provisions 207
IV. Limitations and Derogations 216
V. Remedies 220
E. Evaluation 220

Article 8 – Protection of Personal Data 223
Herke Kranenborg

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 8 223
Select Bibliography 223

A. Field of Application of Article 8 224
I. EU Competence on Data Protection before the Entry into Force of the Lisbon Treaty 224
II. EU Competence on Data Protection after the Entry into Force of the Lisbon Treaty 225
III. The Scope of Application of Secondary Legislation 227
B. Interrelationship of Article 8 with Other Provisions of the Charter 228
I. Article 7 (Right to Respect for Private and Family Life) 228
II. Article 11 (Freedom of Expression and Information) 231
III. Article 17 (Right to Property) and Article 47 (Right to an Effective Remedy and to a Fair Trial) 232

IV. Article 21 (Prohibition of Discrimination) 233
V. Article 42 (Right of Access to Documents) 234
C. Sources of Article 8 235
I. ECHR 235
II. UN Treaties 236
III. Council of Europe Treaties 238
IV. Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development 238
D. Analysis 239
I. General Remarks 239
II. Scope of Application 241
III. Specific Provisions 247
IV. Limitations and Derogations 259
V. Remedies 263
E. Evaluation 264

Article 9 – Right to Marry and Right to Found a Family 267
Shazia Choudhry

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 9 267
Select Bibliography 267

A. Field of Application of Article 9 267
B. Interrelationship of Article 9 with Other Provisions of the Charter 273
C. Sources of Article 9 Rights 274
I. ECHR 274
II. Council of Europe Treaties 275
III. UN Treaties 277
D. Analysis 279
I. General Remarks 279
II. Scope of Application 280
III. Specific Provisions 280
IV. Limitations and Derogations 287
V. Remedies 290
E. Evaluation 290

Article 10 – Right to Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion 291
Ronan McCrea

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 10 291
Select Bibliography 291

A. Field of Application of Article 10 291
B. Interrelationship of Article 10 with Other Provisions of the Charter 293
I. Religious Freedom and Free Expression 293
II. Discrimination on Grounds of Religion 295
C. Sources of Article 10 Rights 298
D. Analysis 299
I. General Remarks 299
II. Scope of Application 300

III. Specific Provisions 301
IV. Limitations and Derogations 301
V. Remedies 307
E. Evaluation 307
F. Conclusion 309

Article 11 – Freedom of Expression and Information 311
Lorna Woods

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 11 311
Select Bibliography 311

A. Field of Application of Article 11 312
B. Interrelationship of Article 11 with Other Provisions of the Charter 314
C. Sources of Article 11 Rights 314
I. ECHR 314
II. UN Treaties 315
III. Council of Europe Treaties 318
IV. Other Sources 318
D. Analysis 320
I. General Remarks 320
II. Scope of Application 321
III. Specific Provisions 325
IV. Limits and Derogations 327
V. Remedies 330
E. Evaluation 331

Article 12 – Freedom of Assembly and of Association 341

Article 12(1) 341
Filip Dorssemont

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 12(1) 341
Select Bibliography 341

A. Field of Application of Article 12(1) 342
B. Interrelationship of Article 12(1) with Other Provisions of the Charter 345
C. Sources of Article 12(1) Rights 347
I. Council of Europe Treaties 347
II. UN Treaties 348
III. Other Sources 349
D. Analysis 349
I. General Remarks 349
II. Scope of Application 350
III. Limitations and Derogations 359
IV. Remedies 360
E. Evaluation 364

Article 12(2) **367**
Jo Shaw and Lamin Khadar

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 12(2) 367
Select Bibliography 367

A. Field of Application of Article 12(2) 368
B. Interrelationship of Article 12(2) with Other Provisions of the Charter 368
C. Sources of Article 12(2) Rights 368
I. ECHR 369
II. UN Treaties 369
III. Other Sources 370
D. Analysis 370
I. General Remarks 370
II. Scope of Application 375
III. Detailed Analysis 375
IV. Limitations and Derogations 377
V. Remedies 377
E. Evaluation 377

Article 13 – Freedom of the Arts and Sciences **379**
Debbie Sayers

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 13 379
Select Bibliography 379

A. Field of Application of Article 13 379
B. Interrelationship of Article 13 with Other Provisions of the Charter 381
C. Sources of Article 13 Rights 382
I. ECHR 382
II. UN Treaties 383
III. Council of Europe Treaties 387
IV. Other Sources 388
D. Analysis 389
I. General Remarks 389
II. Scope of Application 390
III. Specific Provisions 391
IV. Limitations and Derogations 397
V. Remedies 398
E. Evaluation 399

Article 14 – Right to Education **401**
Gisella Gori

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 14 401
Select Bibliography 401

A. Field of Application of Article 14 402
B. Interrelationship of Article 14 with Other Provisions of the Charter 407

C. Sources of Article 14 Rights 408
I. ECHR 408
II. UN Treaties 411
III. Council of Europe Treaties 412
IV. Other Sources 413
D. Analysis 414
I. General Remarks 414
II. Scope of Application 416
III. Specific Provisions 418
IV. Limitations and Derogations 419
V. Remedies 420
E. Evaluation 421

Article 15 – Freedom to Choose an Occupation and Right to Engage in Work 423
Diamond Ashiagbor

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 15 423
Select Bibliography 423

A. Article 15 and the Scope of EU Law 424
B. Interrelationship of Article 15 with Other Provisions of the Charter 425
C. Sources of Article 15 Rights 427
I. European Social Charter 427
II. UN Treaties 429
III. Other Sources 430
D. Analysis 430
I. General Remarks 430
II. Scope of Application 431
III. Specific Provisions 432
IV. Limitations and Derogations 433
V. Remedies 434
E. Evaluation 435

Article 16 – Freedom to Conduct a Business 437
Michele Everson and Rui Correia Gonçalves

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 16 437
Select Bibliography 437

A. Field of Application 438
I. Freedom to Conduct a Business as a Human Right 440
II. Freedom to Conduct a Business as an Element of the European Economic Constitution 441
B. Relation of Article 16 to Articles 15 and 17 of the Charter 442
C. Sources of Law 445
D. Analysis 448
I. General Remarks 448
II. Scope of Application of Article 16 450

III. Specific Provisions 452
IV. Limitation to and Derogations from the Application of Article 16 458
V. Remedies 462
E. Conclusion 463

Article 17 – Right to Property 465

Article 17(1) 465
Ferdinand Wollenschläger

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 17(1) 465
Select Bibliography 465

A. Field of Application of Article 17(1) 467
B. Interrelationship of Article 17(1) with Other Provisions of the Charter 467
C. Sources of Article 17(1) Rights 468
I. ECHR 468
II. UN Treaties 469
III. Other Sources 469
D. Analysis 470
I. General Remarks 470
II. Scope of Application 471
III. Limitations and Derogations 476
IV. Remedies 486
E. Evaluation 487

Article 17(2) 489
Paul Torremans

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 17(2) 489
Select Bibliography 489

A. Field of Application of Article 17(2) 490
B. Interrelationship of Article 17(2) with Other Provisions of the Charter 492
C. Sources of Article 17(2) Rights 494
I. The Human Rights Approach to Copyright in International Instruments 494
II. The Human Rights Approach to Other Intellectual Property Rights in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights 500
III. ECHR 501
D. Analysis 502
I. General Remarks 502
II. Scope of Application 503
III. Specific Provisions 503
IV. Limitations and Derogations 515
V. Remedies 516
E. Evaluation 516

Article 18 – Right to Asylum 519
Maarten den Heijer

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 18 519
Select Bibliography 519

A. Field of Application of Article 18 520
B. Interrelationship of Article 18 with Other Provisions of the Charter 521
C. Sources of Article 18 Rights 523
I. ECHR 523
II. UN Treaties 523
III. Council of Europe Treaties 526
IV. Constitutional Traditions 528
V. Other Sources 529
D. Analysis 530
I. General Remarks 530
II. Scope of Application 531
III. Limitations and Derogations 537
IV. Remedies 539
E. Evaluation 539

Article 19 – Protection in the Event of Removal, Expulsion or Extradition 543
Elspeth Guild

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 19 543
Select Bibliography 543

A. Article 19 and the Scope of EU Law 544
B. Interrelationship of Article 19 with Other Provisions of the Charter 545
C. Sources of Article 19 Rights 546
I. ECHR 546
II. UN Treaties 546
III. Council of Europe Treaties 548
IV. Other Treaties 548
V. Relevant EU law 548
D. Analysis 552
I. General Remarks 552
II. Scope of Application 553
III. Specific Provisions 554
IV. Limitations and Derogations 559
V. Remedies 560
E. Evaluation 561

Article 20 – Equality before the Law 563
Mark Bell

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 20 563
Select Bibliography 563

A. Field of Application of Article 20 563
B. Interrelationship of Article 20 with Other Provisions of the Charter 564

C. Sources of Article 20 Rights 566
I. ECHR 566
II. UN Treaties 567
III. Council of Europe Treaties 567
IV. Other Sources 567
D. Analysis 568
I. General Remarks 568
II. Scope of Application 569
III. Specific Provisions 570
IV. Limitations and Derogations 573
V. Remedies 575
E. Evaluation 576

Article 21 – Non-Discrimination 579
Claire Kilpatrick

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 21 579
Select Bibliography 579

A. Field of Application of Article 21 580
B. Interrelationship of Article 21 with Other Provisions of the Charter 582
C. Sources of Article 21 Rights 584
I. ECHR 584
II. UN Treaties 584
III. Council of Europe Treaties 586
D. Analysis 586
I. General Remarks 586
II. Scope of Application 587
III. Specific Provisions 594
IV. Limitations and Derogations 600
V. Remedies 602
E. Evaluation 602

Article 22 – Cultural, Religious and Linguistic Diversity 605
Rachael Craufurd Smith

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 22 605
Select Bibliography 605

A. Field of Application of Article 22 605
B. Interrelationship of Article 22 with Other Provisions of the Charter 610
C. Sources of Article 22 Rights 613
I. ECHR 613
II. UN Treaties 616
III. Council of Europe Treaties 617
IV. Other 618
D. Analysis 618
I. General Remarks 618
II. Scope of Application 622
III. Specific Provisions 623

IV. Limitations and Derogations 627
V. Remedies 629
E. Evaluation 630

Article 23 – Equality between Women and Men 633
Dagmar Schiek

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 23 633
Select Bibliography 633

A. Field of Application of Article 23 634
B. Interrelationship of Article 23 with Other Provisions of the Charter 636
I. Article 23 and Articles 20, 21 CFREU 636
II. Article 23 and Other Charter Articles 638
C. Sources for Article 23 Rights 639
I. Council of Europe Treaties 639
II. UN Treaties 640
III. EU Law 641
D. Analysis 643
I. General Remarks 643
II. Paragraph 1 644
III. Paragraph 2 650
E. Evaluation 655
I. Opportunities 655
II. Shortcomings 659
III. Conclusion 660

Article 24 – The Rights of the Child 661
Ruth Lamont

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 24 661
Select Bibliography 661

A. Field of Application of Article 24 662
B. Interrelationship of Article 24 with Other Provisions of the Charter 671
C. Sources of Article 24 Rights 672
I. ECHR 672
II. UN Treaties 674
D. Analysis 678
I. General Remarks 678
II. Scope of Application 679
III. Specific Provisions 680
IV. Limitations and Derogations 686
V. Remedies 688
E. Evaluation 689

Article 25 – The Rights of the Elderly 693
Colm O'Cinneide

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 25 693
Select Bibliography 693

A. Field of Application of Article 25 694
B. Interrelationship of Article 25 with Other Provisions of the Charter 695
C. Sources of Article 25 Rights 696
I. ECHR 696
II. UN Treaties 697
III. Council of Europe Treaties 698
IV. Other Sources 699
D. Analysis 701
I. General Remarks 701
II. Scope of Application 703
III. Specific Provisions 705
IV. Limitations and Derogations 706
V. Remedies 706
E. Evaluation 706

Article 26 – Integration of Persons with Disabilities 709
Charlotte O'Brien

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 26 709
Select Bibliography 709

A. Field of Application of Article 26 710
B. Interrelationship of Article 26 with Other Provisions of the Charter 712
C. Sources of Article 26 Rights 717
I. ECHR 717
II. UN Treaties 721
III. Council of Europe Treaties 726
IV. Other Sources 728
D. Analysis 729
I. General Remarks 729
II. Scope of Application 734
III. Specific Provisions 736
IV. Limitations and Derogations 743
V. Remedies 745
E. Evaluation 747

Article 27 – Workers' Right to Information and Consultation within the Undertaking 749
Filip Dorssemont

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 27 749
Select Bibliography 749

A. Field of Application of Article 27 749
B. Interrelationship of Article 27 with Other Provisions of the Charter 750
C. Sources of Article 27 Rights 752
D. Analysis 755
I. General Remarks 755
II. Scope of Application 756
III. Specific Provisions 758

IV. Limitations and Derogations 763
V. Remedies 768
E. Evaluation 769

Article 28 – Right of Collective Bargaining and Action 773
Catherine Barnard

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 28 773
Select Bibliography 773

A. Field of Application of Article 28 CFREU 774
B. Interrelationship of Article 28 with Other Provisions of the Charter 777
I. Other Provisions in the Charter 777
II. Protocol 30 778
C. Sources of Article 28 Rights 779
I. Right to Bargain Collectively 779
II. Right to Take Collective Action 781
D. Analysis 783
I. General Remarks 783
II. Scope of Application: Definition of Terms 784
III. Specific Provisions 787
IV. Limitations and Derogations 792
V. Remedies 793
E. Evaluation 794

Article 29 – Right of Access to Placement Services 795
Diamond Ashiagbor

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 29 795
Select Bibliography 795

A. Article 29 and the Scope of EU Law 795
B. Interrelationship of Article 29 with Other Provisions of the Charter 797
C. Sources of Article 29 Rights 798
I. Council of Europe: European Social Charter 798
II. UN Treaties 798
III. Other Sources 800
D. Analysis 800
I. General Remarks 800
II. Scope of Application 801
III. Specific Provisions 802
IV. Limitations and Derogations 802
V. Remedies 802
E. Evaluation 803

Article 30 – Protection in the Event of Unjustified Dismissal 805
Jeff Kenner

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 30 805
Select Bibliography 805

A. Article 30 and the Scope of EU Law 805

B. Interrelationship of Article 30 with Other Provisions of the Charter 810
C. Sources of Article 30 Rights 814
I. ECHR 814
II. UN Treaties 815
III. ILO 816
IV. Council of Europe Treaties 817
V. National Constitutional Laws 817
D. Analysis 818
I. General Remarks 818
II. Scope of Application 824
III. Specific Provisions 825
IV. Limitations and Derogations 829
V. Remedies 831
E. Evaluation 832

Article 31 – Fair and Just Working Conditions 833
Alan Bogg

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 31 833
Select Bibliography 833

A. Article 31 and the Scope of EU Law 834
B. Interrelationship of Article 31 with Other Provisions of the Charter 836
C. Sources of Article 31 Rights 839
I. Council of Europe Treaties 839
II. Other Sources 841
D. Analysis 845
I. General Remarks 845
II. Scope of Application 850
III. Specific Provisions 852
IV. Limitations and Derogations 862
V. Remedies 867
E. Evaluation 868

Article 32 – Prohibition of Child Labour and Protection of Young People at Work 869
Helen Stalford

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 32 869
Select Bibliography 869

A. Field of Application of Article 32 870
B. Interrelationship of Article 32 with Other Provisions of the Charter 874
C. Sources of Article 32 Rights 876
I. UN Treaties 876
II. Council of Europe Treaties 877
III. Other Sources 878
D. Analysis 879
I. General Remarks 879
II. Scope of Application 879

III. Specific Provisions....883
IV. Limitations and Derogations....884
V. Remedies....886
E. Evaluation....888

Article 33 – Family and Professional Life....891
Cathryn Costello

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 33....891
Select Bibliography....891

A. Field of Application of Article 33....892
B. Interrelationship of Article 33 with Other Provisions of the Charter....895
C. Sources of Article 33 Rights....897
I. ECHR....897
II. UN Treaties....900
III. Council of Europe Sources—The European Social Charter and Revised European Social Charter....905
IV. Other Sources....911
D. Analysis....917
I. General Remarks....917
II. Scope of Application....918
III. Specific Provisions and Issues....919
IV. Limitations and Derogations....922
V. Remedies....923
E. Evaluation....924

Article 34 – Social Security and Social Assistance....927
Robin White

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 34....927
Select Bibliography....927

A. Field of Application of Article 34....928
B. Interrelationship of Article 34 with Other Provisions of the Charter....930
C. Sources of Article 34 Rights....930
I. ECHR....930
II. UN Treaties....932
III. Council of Europe Treaties....933
IV. Other Sources....936
D. Analysis....936
I. General Remarks....936
II. Scope of Application....937
III. Specific Provisions....941
IV. Limitations and Derogations....947
V. Remedies....948
E. Evaluation....948

Article 35 – The Right to Health Care 951
Tamara Hervey and Jean McHale

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 35 951
Select Bibliography 951

A. Field of Application of Article 35 951
B. Interrelationship of Article 35 with Other Provisions of the Charter 952
C. Sources of Article 35 Rights 953
  I. ECHR 953
  II. UN Treaties 953
  III. Council of Europe Treaties 954
  IV. Other Sources 956
D. Analysis 957
  I. General Remarks 957
  II. Scope of Application 957
  III. Specific Provisions 959
  IV. Limitations and Derogations 966
  V. Remedies 966
E. Evaluation 967

Article 36 – Access to Services of General Economic Interest 969
Erika Szyszczak

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 36 969
Select Bibliography 969

A. Article 36 and the Scope of EU Law 969
B. Interrelationship of Article 36 with Other Provisions of the Charter 970
C. Sources of Article 36 'Rights' and 'Principles' 971
D. Analysis 971
  I. General Remarks 971
  II. Scope of Application 972
  III. Specific Provisions 972
  IV. Limitations and Derogations 981
  V. Remedies 981
E. Evaluation 981

Article 37 – Environmental Protection 983
Elisa Morgera and Gracia Marín Durán

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 37 983
Select Bibliography 983

A. Field of Application of Article 37 984
B. Interrelationship of Article 37 with Other Provisions of the Charter 985
C. Sources of Article 37 987
  I. EU Law 987
  II. National Constitutional Law 989

D. Analysis 991
I. General Remarks 991
II. Specific Provisions 992
III. Legal Nature 995
IV. Limitations and Derogations 997
V. Remedies 1000
E. Evaluation 1002

Article 38 – Consumer Protection **1005**
Steve Weatherill

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 38 1005
Select Bibliography 1005

A. Field of Application of Article 38 1005
B. Interrelationship of Article 38 with Other Provisions of the Charter 1006
C. Sources of Article 38 Rights 1006
D. Analysis 1008
I. General Remarks 1008
II. Scope of Application 1010
III. Specific Provisions 1010
IV. Limitations 1024
V. Remedies 1025
E. Evaluation 1025

Article 39 – Right to Vote and to Stand as a Candidate at Elections to the European Parliament **1027**
Lamin Khadar and Jo Shaw

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 39 1027
Select Bibliography 1027

A. Field of Application of Article 39 1028
B. Interrelationship of Article 39 with Other Provisions of the Charter 1028
C. Sources of Article 39 Rights 1030
I. ECHR 1030
II. UN Treaties 1030
III. Council of Europe Treaties 1032
IV. Other Sources 1032
D. Analysis 1033
I. General Remarks 1033
II. Scope of Application 1040
III. Specific Provisions 1040
IV. Limitations and Derogations 1046
V. Remedies 1050
E. Evaluation 1052

Article 40 – Right to Vote and to Stand as a Candidate at Municipal Elections **1057**
Kees Groenendijk

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 40 1057
Select Bibliography 1057

A. Field of Application of Article 40 1058
B. Interrelationship of Article 40 with Other Provisions of the Charter 1058
C. Sources of Article 40 Rights 1059
  I. ECHR 1059
  II. UN Treaties 1060
  III. Council of Europe 1061
  IV. Other Sources 1061
D. Analysis 1062
  I. General Remarks 1062
  II. Scope of Application 1063
  III. Specific Provisions 1064
  IV. Limitations and Derogations 1065
  V. Remedies 1066
E. Evaluation 1066

Article 41 – Right to Good Administration **1069**
Paul Craig

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 41 1069
Select Bibliography 1069

A. Article 41 and the Scope of EU Law 1070
B. Interrelationship of Article 41 with Other Provisions of the Charter 1071
C. Sources of Article 41 Rights 1071
D. Analysis 1072
  I. General Remarks 1072
  II. Scope of Application 1072
  III. Specific Provisions 1076
  IV. Limitations and Derogations 1097
  V. Remedies 1097
E. Evaluation 1098

Article 42 – Right of Access to Documents **1099**
Deirdre Curtin and Joana Mendes

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 42 1099
Select Bibliography 1099

A. Field of Application of Article 42 1100
B. Interrelationship of Article 42 with Other Provisions of the Charter 1102
C. Sources of Article 42 Rights 1103

D. Analysis 1104
I. General Remarks 1104
II. Scope of Application 1107
III. Specific Provisions 1111
IV. Limitations and Derogations 1112
V. Remedies 1118
E. Evaluation 1118

Article 43 – European Ombudsman 1121
Ian Harden

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 43 1121
Select Bibliography 1121

A. Field of Application of Article 43 1121
B. Interrelationship of Article 43 with Other Provisions of the Charter 1124
C. Sources of Article 43 Rights 1124
I. UN Treaties 1125
II. Council of Europe Treaties 1125
III. Other Sources 1126
D. Analysis 1127
I. General Remarks 1127
II. Scope of Application 1129
III. Specific Provisions 1136
IV. Limitations and Derogations 1140
V. Remedies 1141
E. Evaluation 1143
I. The Ombudsman Remedy as an Alternative Route to Redress 1144
II. The Ombudsman Remedy as an Instrument of Public Participation 1147
III. Future Trends 1149

Article 44 – Right to Petition 1151
Mats Lindfelt

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 44 1151
Selected Bibliography 1151

A. Field of Application of Article 44 1151
B. Interrelationship with Other Provisions of the Charter 1152
C. Sources of Article 44 Rights 1153
D. Analysis 1154
I. General Remarks 1154
II. Scope of Application 1155
III. Specific Provisions 1157
IV. Limitations 1158
V. Remedies 1158
E. Evaluation 1159
I. A Tool for Democratic Control 1159

Article 45 – Freedom of Movement and of Residence **1161**
Eleanor Spaventa

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 45 1161
Select Bibliography 1161

A. Field of Application of Article 45 1161
B. Interrelationship of Article 45 with Other Provisions of the Charter 1162
C. Sources of Article 45 Rights 1163
D. Analysis 1164
I. General Remarks 1164
II. Scope of Application—Article 45(1) 1164
III. Right to Move, Right to Enter and Right to Exit 1165
IV. Right to Reside 1166
V. The Right to Move and Claims Against the Member State of Origin 1172
VI. Nature of Charter Rights—and Purely Internal Situations 1174
VII. Article 45(2) 1175
VIII. Remedies 1175
E. Evaluation 1176

Article 46 – Diplomatic and Consular Protection **1177**
Eileen Denza

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 46 1177
Select Bibliography 1177

A. Field of Application of Article 46 1178
B. Interrelationship of Article 46 with Other Provisions of the Charter 1178
C. Sources of Article 46 Rights 1179
I. Commission Proposals and Research 1180
II. National Implementing Measures 1181
D. Analysis 1181
I. General Remarks 1181
II. Background—Diplomatic Protection, Protection by Diplomatic Missions and Consular Protection 1184
III. Scope of the 'Right' to Protection 1185
IV. Whether 'Diplomatic Protection' in the Formal Sense is Covered 1187
V. Specific Provisions 1188
VI. Limitations 1193
VII. Remedies 1193
E. Evaluation 1194

Article 47 – Right to an Effective Remedy and to a Fair Trial **1197**
Pekka Aalto, Herwig CH Hofmann, Liisa Holopainen, Elina Paunio, Laurent Pech, Debbie Sayers, Dinah Shelton and Angela Ward

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 47 1197
Select Bibliography 1198

A. Field of Application 1199
B. Interrelationship with Other Provisions of the Charter 1199

C. Sources of Article 47 Rights 1200
I. An 'Effective Remedy' 1200
II. A 'Fair and Public Hearing' 1205
III. 'Within a Reasonable Time' 1207
IV. 'By an Independent and Impartial Tribunal Previously Established by Law' 1207
V. Legal Aid for Indigents 1209
D. Analysis 1209
I. General Remarks 1209
II. Scope of Application 1210
III. Specific Provisions (Meaning) 1211
IV. Effective Remedies before Member State Courts and the Principle of Non-Discrimination 1228
V. Damages for Breach of the Charter 1235
VI. Effective Judicial Remedies before the Court of Justice 1241
VII. Article 47(2): Everyone is entitled to a fair and public hearing within a reasonable time *by an independent and impartial tribunal previously established by law*. Everyone shall have the possibility of being advised, defended and represented 1250
VIII. Article 47(2): Everyone is entitled to a *fair and public hearing within a reasonable time* by an independent and impartial tribunal previously established by law. Everyone shall have the possibility of being advised, defended and represented 1258
IX. Article 47(3): Legal aid shall be made available to those who lack sufficient resources in so far as such aid is necessary to ensure effective access to justice 1269
E. Evaluation 1273

Article 48 – Presumption of Innocence and Right of Defence (Administrative Law) 1277
Hanns Peter Nehl

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 48 1277
Select Bibliography 1277

I. ARTICLE 48(1)—PRESUMPTION OF INNOCENCE

A. Field of Application of Article 48(1) 1278
B. Interrelationship of Article 48(1) with Other Provisions of the Charter 1279
C. Sources of Rights under Article 48(1) 1280
D. Analysis 1281
I. General Remarks 1281
II. Scope of Application 1282
III. Specific Provisions: Substantive Content of Article 48(1) 1283
IV. Limitations and Derogations 1287
V. Remedies 1288
E. Evaluation 1289

II. ARTICLE 48(2)—RIGHTS OF THE DEFENCE

A. Field of Application of Article 48(2) 1289
B. Interrelationship of Article 48(2) with Other Provisions of the Charter 1291

C. Sources of Rights under Article 48(2) 1291
D. Analysis 1292
I. General Remarks 1292
II. Scope of Application 1292
III. Specific Provisions: Substantive Content of Article 48(2) 1293
IV. Limitations and Derogations 1298
V. Remedies 1298
E. Evaluation 1301

Article 48 – Presumption of Innocence and Right of Defence (Criminal Law) 1303
Debbie Sayers

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 48 1303
Select Bibliography 1303

I. ARTICLE 48(1)—PRESUMPTION OF INNOCENCE

A. Field of Application of Article 48(1) 1304
B. Interrelationship of Article 48(1) with Other Provisions of the Charter 1305
C. Sources of Rights under Article 48(1) 1306
I. ECHR 1306
II. UN Treaties 1307
III. Council of Europe Treaties 1309
IV. Other Sources 1309

II. ARTICLE 48(2)—RIGHTS OF THE DEFENCE

A. Field of Application of Article 48(2) 1309
B. Interrelationship of Article 48(2) with Other Provisions of the Charter 1313
C. Sources of Rights under Article 48(2) 1313
I. ECHR 1313
II. UN Treaties 1316
III. Other Sources 1319
D. Analysis 1319
I. General Remarks 1319
II. Scope of Application 1321
III. Specific Provisions: Substantive Content of Article 48 1322
IV. Limitations and Derogations 1344
V. Remedies 1345
E. Evaluation 1347

Article 49 – Principles of Legality and Proportionality of Criminal Offences and Penalties 1351
Valsamis Mitsilegas

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 49 1351
Select Bibliography 1351

A. Field of Application of Article 49 1352
B. Interrelationship of Article 49 with Other Provisions of the Charter 1352

C. Sources of Rights under Article 49 1353
I. UN Sources 1353
II. ECHR 1354
D. Analysis 1358
I. General Remarks 1358
II. Legality 1359
III. Proportionality 1365
E. Evaluation 1371

Article 50 – Right not to be Tried or Punished Twice in Criminal Proceedings for the same Criminal Offence 1373
Jonathan Tomkin

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 50 1373
Select Bibliography 1373

A. Field of Application of Article 50 1374
I. Criminal Law 1375
II. Administrative Law Proceedings and Sanctions 1377
B. Interrelationship of Article 50 with Other Provisions of the Charter 1378
C. Sources of Rights under Article 50 1379
I. ECHR 1380
II. UN Treaties 1381
III. Other Sources 1383
D. Analysis 1384
I. General Remarks 1384
II. Scope of Application 1385
III. Specific Provisions 1392
IV. Limitations and Derogations 1407
V. Remedies 1410
E. Evaluation 1411

Article 51 – Field of Application 1413
Angela Ward

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 51 1413
Select Bibliography 1414

A. Field of Application of Article 51 1415
B. Interrelationship of Article 51 with Other Provisions of the Charter 1415
I. Article 51(1) 1415
II. Article 51(2) 1421
C. Sources of Article 51 Rules 1422
D. Analysis 1424
I. General Remarks 1424
II. Specific Provisions 1427
E. Evaluation 1449

Article 52 – Scope and Interpretation of Rights and Principles 1455
Steve Peers and Sacha Prechal

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 52 1455
Select Bibliography 1457

A. Field of Application of Article 52 1458
B. Interrelationship of Article 52 with Other Provisions of the Charter 1458
C. Sources of Article 52 Rules 1459
D. Analysis 1459
I. General Remarks 1459
II. Specific Provisions 1461
E. Evaluation 1521

Article 53 – Level of Protection 1523
Bruno de Witte

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 53 1523
Select Bibliography 1523

A. Sources of Article 53 1524
B. Analysis 1524
I. Relation with the Rest of European Union Law 1525
II. Relation with International Law 1526
III. Relation with National Constitutions 1527
IV. An Exception to the Primacy of EU Law? 1529
V. The Legal Significance of Article 53 1533
C. Conclusion 1537

Article 54 – Abuse of Rights 1539
Lorna Woods

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 54 1539
Select Bibliography 1539

A. Article 54 and the Scope of EU Law 1539
B. Interrelationship of Article 54 with Other Provisions of the Charter 1540
C. Sources of Article 54 Rights 1540
I. ECHR 1540
II. UN Treaties 1541
III. Council of Europe Treaties 1543
IV. Other Sources 1544
D. Analysis 1545
I. General Remarks 1545
II. Scope of Application 1545
III. Specific Provisions 1547
IV. Limits and Derogation 1550
E. Evaluation 1550

Part II – Reflections on the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights

The Place of the Charter in the EU Constitutional Edifice 1559
Koen Lenaerts and José Antonio Gutiérrez-Fons

A. The Scope of Application of the Charter 1561
   I. *Wachauf* as a Token of Positive Action on the Part of the Member States 1562
   II. The Derogation Situation 1568
   III. *Annibaldi* as an Example of the Situations where the Charter does not Apply 1569
B. The Charter and Primary EU Law 1571
   I. The Charter and the Treaties 1571
   II. The Charter and General Principles of EU Law 1575
C. The Charter and the Common Constitutional Space 1580
   I. The Charter and the ECHR 1580
   II. The Charter and the Constitutional Traditions Common to the Member States 1586
D. Concluding Remarks 1592

Protocol (No 30) on the Application of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union to Poland and the United Kingdom 1595
Anthony Arnull

Select Bibliography 1596

A. Introduction 1597
B. The Background to Protocol No 30 1599
C. The Meaning and Effect of Protocol No 30 1603
   I. The Preamble 1603
   II. Article 1(1) of the Protocol 1604
   III. Article 1(2) of the Protocol 1607
   IV. Article 2 of the Protocol 1609
D. Evaluation 1610

The EU Fundamental Rights Agency and the Fundamental Rights Charter: How Fundamental is the Link Between them? 1613
Gabriel N Toggenburg

A. Introduction 1613
B. The FRA: a Glimpse at its Role in the EU's Institutional Landscape 1614
C. The Agency's Founding Regulation and its Multiannual Framework: a Case of 'Charter-blindness'? 1616
D. The Charter in the Agency's Practice: Legal Benchmark and Tool 1619
E. Instead of Conclusions: a Triptych of Proposals for Making the Link Between the Charter and the Agency even more Fundamental 1623

The Implementation of the Charter by the Institutions of the European Union 1627
Olivier De Schutter

A. Introduction 1627
B. The Integration of the Charter of Fundamental Rights in the Work of the European Parliament 1629
I. The Parliament's Role in Monitoring the EU Member States 1629
II. The Parliament as Guardian of Legality 1636
III. The Parliament as Co-legislator 1641
C. The Integration of the Charter of Fundamental Rights by the European Commission 1643
I. Assessment of Compatibility of Legislative Proposals with the Charter 1643
II. Impact Assessments 1645
III. Ensuring the Implementation of the Charter of Fundamental Rights 1648
D. The Integration of the Charter of Fundamental Rights by the Council of the EU 1650
E. The Integration of the Charter of Fundamental Rights in Law- and Policy-making: the Next Steps 1652

The Extraterritorial Application of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights: From Territoriality to Facticity, the Effectiveness Model 1657
Violeta Moreno-Lax and Cathryn Costello

Select Bibliography 1657

A. Introduction 1658
B. Relevant Provisions: The Treaty and the Charter 1661
C. The Place of 'Jurisdiction' in the EU Legal Order 1663
I. 'PIL Jurisdiction' and EU Law 1663
II. 'IHRL Jurisdiction' and EU Law 1668
D. Analysis: The Applicability of EU Fundamental Rights, an Autonomous Paradigm 1679
E. Evaluation: The Emergence of a New Model 1682

The Charter and Universal Human Rights Instruments 1685
Allan Rosas

A. Introduction 1685
B. The Relevance of International Human Rights Instruments for the Development of EU Fundamental Rights 1687
C. Examples from Case Law 1691
D. Human Rights Instruments in EU External Relations 1694
E. The Lisbon Treaty, the Charter and Universal Instruments 1697
F. Conclusions 1700

Fundamental Social Rights in the Charter—Are They Rights? Are They Fundamental? 1703
Niilo Jääskinen

A. Introduction 1703
B. A Short History of EU Fundamental Social Rights 1704
C. Nature and Effects of Fundamental Social Rights 1707
I. Philosophical Foundations of Fundamental Social Rights 1708
II. Effects of Fundamental Social Rights 1710
D. Protection of Fundamental Social Rights in a Multi-level Constitutional Structure 1710
E. From an Exception to the Fundamental 1712

The Explanations Relating to the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union 1715
Jean-Paul Jacqué

A. The Origin of the Explanations 1715
I. The First Convention: the Explanations as an Explanatory Report 1716
II. The Second Convention: Moving Towards a Specific Status for the Explanations 1717
B. A Diversified Content 1718
C. The Use of the Explanations in Jurisdiction 1721
I. The Search for the Source of a Guaranteed Right 1721
II. Interpreting the Charter's Guaranteed Rights and General Provisions 1722
D. Conclusion 1724

Part III – Commentary on the Treaty of EU Accession to the European Convention on Human Rights

Agreement on the Accession of the European Union to the European Convention on Human Rights 1727
Paul Gragl

Text of the Agreement 1727
Select Bibliography 1733

A. Background and Overview of EU Accession to the ECHR 1734
I. The Long History of Accession 1734
II. The Constraints of Article 218 TFEU, Article 6(2) TEU, and Protocol No 8 to the Treaties 1737
III. The Relevance of Article 52(3) of the Charter of Fundamental Rights 1741
B. The Substantive Provisions of the Accession Agreement 1745
Article 1—Scope of the Accession and Amendments to Article 59 of the Convention 1745
Article 2—Reservations to the Convention and the Protocols 1758
Article 3—Co-Respondent Mechanism 1761
Article 4—Inter-Party Cases 1790

Article 5—Interpretation of Articles 35 and 55 of the Convention 1795
Article 6—Election of Judges 1797
Article 7—Participation of the European Union in the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe 1801
Article 8—Participation of the European Union in the Expenditure Related to the Convention 1812
Article 9—Relations with other Agreements 1815
Article 10—Signature and Entry into Force 1817
Article 11—Reservations 1819
Article 12—Notifications 1819
C. Appraisal 1820

Appendix 1825
Index 1861