

# Contents

## Acronyms and Abbreviations — XVII

### Introduction — 1

- A. Objectives and Approach — 1
- B. Structure — 4

### Chapter 1 — 5

#### Rise of Dark Trading and its Classification Within the Market Structure — 5

- A. Definition and Classification of Dark Trading — 6
  - I. Definition of Dark Trading — 7
  - II. Dark Trading vs. Lit Trading — 7
    - 1. Key Characteristics — 8
    - 2. Lit Venues — 10
      - a. Public Securities Exchanges — 11
      - b. Alternative Trading Systems — 13
    - III. Categories of Dark Trading — 16
      - 1. Dark Orders — 16
      - 2. Dark Pools — 17
        - a. Definition and Operation — 17
        - b. Types of Dark Pools — 20
      - 3. Broker-Dealer Internalization/Systematic Internalization — 22
- B. The Rise of Dark Trading — 24
  - I. Historical Development — 26
    - 1. Technological Changes — 26
      - a. Automated Trading and Algorithmic Trading — 28
      - b. High-frequency Trading — 29
      - c. Impact of HFT on the Market and the May 6<sup>th</sup> Flash Crash — 34
      - d. Relation between High-frequency Trading and Dark Trading — 36
    - 2. Regulatory Changes — 38
      - a. US Market — 38
      - b. EU Market — 42
    - 3. Globalization — 44
  - II. Other Factors — 45
- C. Conclusion to Chapter 1 — 48

**Chapter 2 — 51**

**The Impact of Dark Trading on The Market — 51**

- A. Introduction to Evaluated Literature and Overview — 53**
  - I. Categorization of Literature — 54**
  - II. Overview of Main Issues — 57**
    - 1. Primary Objectives of Securities Regulation — 60**
      - a. Investor Protection — 60**
      - b. Market Efficiency — 61**
      - c. Market Quality — 62**
      - d. Market Integrity — 62**
      - e. Market Stability — 63**
    - 2. Specification of Harms and Benefits — 64**
    - 3. Objectives and Interests Affected by Dark Trading — 64**
- B. Issues Raised in Regard to Dark Trading — 67**
  - I. Lack of Transparency and Impact on Price Discovery — 67**
    - 1. A Security's Price — 68**
    - 2. Price Discovery and Price Formation — 71**
    - 3. Impact of Dark Trading on Price Discovery — 72**
      - a. Impact Due to Lack of Transparency — 72**
      - b. Impact Due to Reference Pricing — 75**
    - 4. Analysis of Academic Literature — 78**
  - II. Impact due to the Facilitation of Market Fragmentation — 83**
    - 1. Dark Trading and Fragmentation — 84**
    - 2. Impact of Dark Fragmentation — 84**
      - a. Impact of Dark Fragmentation on Liquidity — 85**
      - b. Impact of Dark Fragmentation on Stock Market Indices — 88**
    - 3. Analysis of Academic Literature — 90**
  - III. Fair Access to Information and Trading Venues — 94**
    - 1. Impact Due to Lack of Information — 95**
      - a. Informational Asymmetries Between Lit Traders and Dark Traders — 96**
      - b. Informational Asymmetries Among Dark Traders — 97**
    - 2. Impact Due to Discretionary Access Rules — 97**
    - 3. Analysis of Academic Literature — 99**
  - IV. Impact by Predatory Trading Strategies — 101**
    - 1. Predatory Trading Strategies — 105**
      - a. Strategies to Exploit Price Discrepancies — 106**
      - b. Strategies to Influence the Prices — 108**

- 2. Impact due to Lack of Transparency and Supervision — 110
- 3. Analysis of Academic Literature — 111
- C. Conclusion to Chapter 2 — 114

### **Chapter 3 — 119**

- Regulatory Approaches of Different Legal Systems — 119
- A. Overview of Different Regulatory Approaches — 122
  - I. Core Elements of Dark Trading Regulation — 123
  - II. The Regulatory Environment of the Major Jurisdictions — 124
- B. Regulation of Dark Trading in the US — 128
  - I. The SEC's Regulation of Dark Trading — 129
    - 1. Regulation ATS of 1998 — 130
      - a. Definition of Alternative Trading System — 132
      - b. Registration Requirements — 132
      - c. General Requirements and SRO Membership — 133
      - d. Transparency Requirements — 134
      - e. Fair Access — 134
      - f. Critique and Conclusion — 134
    - 2. Regulation NMS of 2005 — 136
      - a. Order Protection Rule — 137
      - b. Access Rule — 138
      - c. Sub-Penny Rule — 139
      - d. Amended Market Data Rules — 140
      - e. Critique and Conclusion — 141
    - 3. Latest Regulatory Proposals by the SEC — 144
      - a. Proposal to Integrate Dark Pools Into the NMS — 144
      - b. Proposal of Trade-at Rule — 148
      - c. Proposal to Enhance Transparency and Oversight of ATSS — 150
      - d. Proposal to Enhance Order Handling Information — 152
      - e. Critique and Conclusion — 154
  - II. FINRA's Regulation of Dark Trading — 154
  - III. Enforcement Actions and Case Law Analysis — 157
    - 1. Legal Basis and General Liability Rules — 157
    - 2. The Enforcement Actions — 160
      - a. In the Matter of Pipeline Trading — 160
      - b. In the Matter of eBX — 162
      - c. In the Matter of Liquidnet — 163
      - d. In the Matter of UBS — 164
      - e. In the Matter of ITG — 165

- f. In the Matter of Credit Suisse — **166**
        - g. In the Matter of Barclays Capital — **167**
        - h. In the Matter of Deutsche Bank — **169**
      - 3. Conclusion — **171**
    - IV. Critique and Conclusion on US Regulation — **172**
  - C. Regulation of Dark Trading in the EU — **174**
    - I. The Original MiFID of 2004 — **177**
      - 1. Main Regulatory Achievements — **179**
        - a. Abolition of the Concentration Rule — **179**
        - b. New Categories of Trading Venues — **179**
        - c. Enhanced Transparency Regime — **181**
      - 2. Remaining Gaps and New Challenges — **184**
    - II. MiFID II and MiFIR — **186**
      - 1. Overview of Legislative Process, Regulatory Concept, Timeframe and Transposition into National Laws — **187**
        - a. Legislative Process — **188**
        - b. Regulatory Concept — **189**
        - c. Timeframe — **192**
        - d. Transposition of MiFID II/MiFIR into National Laws — **192**
      - 2. The Role of ESMA — **194**
        - a. Level 2 – Technical Advice and Binding Technical Standards — **195**
        - b. Level 3 – Guidelines and Recommendations — **196**
        - c. Level 4 – Supervisory and Enforcement Power — **197**
      - 3. Regulatory Changes and New Provisions under MiFID II/ MiFIR — **199**
        - a. Regulatory Changes to Classification of Multilateral Trading Venues and Introduction of Organized Trading Facilities — **200**
        - b. Regulatory Changes for Systematic Internalizers — **206**
        - c. Trading Obligation — **208**
        - d. Enhanced Transparency Regime and Changes to Transparency Waivers — **209**
        - e. Double Volume Caps for Dark Trading — **216**
        - f. Distribution and Consolidation of Trading Data — **218**
        - g. Regulation of Algorithmic Trading and HFT — **222**
      - 4. Critique and Conclusion on the MiFID II/MiFIR Regime — **227**
        - a. Venue Classification — **228**
        - b. Transparency Regime — **229**
        - c. Double Volume Caps — **230**

- d. Regulation of HFT — 234
- e. General Critique and Conclusion — 236
- D. Conclusion to Chapter 3 — 237

#### **Chapter 4 — 239**

##### **Final Comparison and Recommendations — 239**

- A. Final Comparison — 240
  - I. Categorization of Trading Venues — 241
  - II. Transparency Regimes — 242
  - III. Price Discovery and Fair Access — 243
  - IV. Data Consolidation — 245
  - V. Algorithmic Trading Practices and HFT — 246
  - VI. Supervision — 247
  - VII. Conclusion — 248
- B. Future Prospects and Recommendations — 250
  - I. Dark Trading is Not the Sole Cause for Market Failure — 250
  - II. Regulators Should Consider the Benefits and Incentives — 251
  - III. Unlimited Transparency is Not a Sufficient Solution — 253
  - IV. Regulation of Trading Practices and HFT — 255
  - V. The Type of Regulation Matters — 256
  - VI. Regulatory Intervention Should be Simple and Exceptional — 258
  - VII. Conclusion — 260

##### **Summary of the Final Conclusions — 261**

Conclusions on the development and the classification of dark trading: — 261

Conclusions on the impact of dark trading on the market and market participants: — 262

Conclusions on the comparison of the regulatory approaches in the US and the EU: — 263

Conclusion on the assessment of the regulatory approaches taking into consideration the economic findings — 266

##### **Appendix – Literature Review — 269**

##### **Bibliography — 278**

##### **Index — 294**