

---

## BRIEF CONTENTS

---

<i>Preface</i> .....	v
<i>Contents</i> .....	xi
<i>Table of Abbreviations</i> .....	xxxi
<i>Table of Cases and Legislation</i> .....	xxxv

<b>Introduction: The Internationalisation of Tax Law and the Importance of Taxpayers' Rights.....</b>	<b>1</b>
---	----------

### PART I TAXATION AND INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

1. Sources of International (Tax) Law .....	7
2. The Relationship between National and International Law .....	31
3. Possible Approaches to Human Rights and Taxation .....	70

### PART II HUMAN RIGHTS IN TAX MATTERS

4. General Principles Protecting Taxpayers' Rights.....	83
5. Special Features of Human Rights in Taxation .....	171
6. The Procedural Rights.....	206
7. Taxpayers' Rights Related to Sanctions.....	311
8. Substantive Rights.....	345

### PART III AN INTERNATIONAL TAX REGIME CONTAINING MINIMUM STANDARDS FOR THE PROTECTION OF TAXPAYERS' RIGHTS

9. The Emergence of an International Tax Regime.....	471
10. International Minimum Standards for the Protection of Taxpayers' Rights.....	490
11. Proposed International Instruments .....	505

<i>List of Countries' Official Court Names</i> .....	519
<i>Bibliography</i> .....	523
<i>Index</i> .....	541

---

# CONTENTS

---

Preface .....	v
Brief Contents .....	ix
Table of Abbreviations .....	xxxi
Table of Cases and Legislation .....	xxxv
Introduction: The Internationalisation of Tax Law and the Importance of Taxpayers' Rights.....	1

## PART I TAXATION AND INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

1. Sources of International (Tax) Law .....	7
1.1. Introduction .....	7
1.2. International Conventions .....	7
1.2.1. Interpretation of International Conventions .....	8
1.2.2. Treaties Containing Taxpayers' Rights .....	8
1.2.2.1. Procedural Rights .....	8
1.2.2.2. Substantive Rights .....	9
1.3. Customary International Law.....	11
1.3.1. The ILC's and ILA's Approaches .....	11
1.3.2. Objective Element: State Practice.....	12
1.3.2.1. Quantitative and Qualitative Requirements for State Practice.....	12
1.3.2.2. State Practice and Treaties .....	14
1.3.2.3. Other Actors, International Organisations .....	16
1.3.2.4. Internal Practice.....	16
1.3.2.5. The Persistent Objector Rule.....	17
1.3.3. Subjective Element: <i>Opinio Iuris</i> .....	17
1.3.3.1. The ILC's and ILA's Approaches .....	18
1.3.3.2. Taxpayers Charters as Evidence for <i>Opinio Iuris</i> ? .....	19
1.3.4. The Role of National and International Courts in the Formation and Identification of Customary International Law.....	20
1.3.4.1. Decisions of National Courts as State Practice.....	20
1.3.4.2. Decisions of National Courts as <i>Opinio Iuris</i> .....	20
1.3.4.3. Decisions of International Courts and Tribunals as Subsidiary Means for the Determination of CIL Rules.....	21
1.4. General Principles.....	22
1.5. Subsidiary Means for the Determination of Rules of Law .....	24
1.5.1. Judicial Decisions .....	24
1.5.2. Teachings of the Most Highly Qualified Publicists of the Various Nations .....	26
1.6. Soft Law .....	28

2.	The Relationship between National and International Law .....	31
2.1.	Monism vs Dualism .....	31
2.2.	Direct Effect .....	33
2.2.1.	Direct Applicability of Double Tax Conventions .....	34
2.2.1.1.	General Issues .....	34
2.2.1.2.	The Creation of Individual Rights or Obligations through International Treaties .....	35
2.2.1.3.	Direct Applicability of Individual Treaty Rights before Domestic Courts .....	36
2.2.1.4.	Double Taxation Conventions (DTCs): Conferral of Rights upon Individuals? .....	40
2.2.1.4.1.	Invocability of DTC Rights within the National Legal Order .....	41
2.2.1.4.2.	Invocability of DTC Rights at International Level .....	41
2.3.	The Relationship between National and International Law in the Different Regions .....	43
2.3.1.	Africa .....	43
2.3.2.	Americas .....	46
2.3.2.1.	Regional Arrangements .....	46
2.3.2.1.1.	The Inter-American System for the Protection of Human Rights .....	46
2.3.2.1.2.	The Andean Community .....	47
2.3.2.2.	Latin American Countries .....	48
2.3.2.2.1.	Argentina .....	48
2.3.2.2.2.	Brazil .....	49
2.3.2.2.3.	Chile .....	51
2.3.2.2.4.	Peru .....	52
2.3.2.3.	The Caribbean .....	53
2.3.2.4.	United States .....	53
2.3.3.	Asia .....	54
2.3.3.1.	China .....	54
2.3.3.2.	India .....	55
2.3.3.3.	Israel .....	55
2.3.3.4.	Japan .....	56
2.3.4.	Europe .....	57
2.3.4.1.	European Union .....	57
2.3.4.1.1.	Introduction .....	57
2.3.4.1.2.	The Free Flow of Fundamental Values between National, Supranational and International Legal Orders and its Impact on Taxation: The Specific Case of the European Union .....	60
2.3.4.1.2.1.	The Impact of the Member States' Domestic Constitutional Orders on EU Law and Vice Versa .....	60

2.3.4.1.2.1.1.	The Enrichment of the EU Legal Order by the National Legal Orders .....	60
2.3.4.1.2.1.2.	The Enrichment of the National Legal Orders by the EU Legal Order: Limitations .....	61
2.3.4.1.2.1.3.	The Enrichment of the National Legal Orders by the EU Legal Order: New Rights for Taxpayers under the Dispute Resolution Directive? .....	62
2.3.4.1.2.1.4.	Beyond the EU Charter: Further Development of Fundamental Values as General Principles of Union Law.....	62
2.3.4.1.2.2.	The Relationship between the European Union and the European Human Rights System: Its Impact on Taxation .....	64
2.3.4.1.2.2.1.	The Possible Consequences of the Accession of the EU to the ECHR.....	64
2.3.4.1.2.2.2.	Protection of Taxpayers under the ECHR and the EU Charter.....	65
2.3.4.2.	Switzerland .....	66
2.3.4.3.	United Kingdom .....	67
2.3.5.	Oceania.....	68
2.3.5.1.	Australia.....	68
2.3.5.2.	New Zealand .....	69
3.	Possible Approaches to Human Rights and Taxation .....	70
3.1.	Two Groups of Taxpayers' Rights: Individual Rights and 'Collective Rights' .....	70
3.2.	The Individual Rights Vision .....	72
3.3.	The 'Collective Rights' Vision .....	74
3.3.1.	Background of the 'Collective Rights' Vision .....	74
3.3.2.	Function of the Collective Rights' Vision .....	78
3.4.	The Approach of Our Committee to Individual and Collective Rights.....	78
3.5.	The Scope of Protection of Fundamental Human Rights in Tax Matters from the Perspective of Public International Law.....	79

**PART II**  
**HUMAN RIGHTS IN TAX MATTERS**

4.	General Principles Protecting Taxpayers' Rights.....	83
4.1.	Rule of Law.....	83
4.1.1.	Introduction.....	83
4.1.2.	Legal Certainty .....	84
4.1.2.1.	Sufficient Precision of the Law.....	84
4.1.2.2.	Non-retroactivity of Legal Rules.....	85
4.1.2.3.	Tax Rulings .....	86
4.1.2.4.	Stabilisation Agreements.....	86
4.1.3.	Different Regions.....	87
4.1.3.1.	Africa.....	87
4.1.3.1.1.	Law in Context.....	87
4.1.3.1.2.	Tax Certainty in African Constitutions .....	87
4.1.3.2.	Americas .....	89
4.1.3.2.1.	The Inter-American System for the Protection of Human Rights.....	89
4.1.3.2.2.	Latin America.....	89
4.1.3.2.2.1.	Argentina .....	89
4.1.3.2.2.2.	Brazil.....	91
4.1.3.2.2.2.1.	The Principle of Legality and its Relations with the Rules on Competence.....	91
4.1.3.2.2.2.2.	The Scope and Boundaries of the Principle of Legality.....	91
4.1.3.2.2.2.3.	The Principles of Non-retroactivity and the Protection of Legitimate Expectation .....	92
4.1.3.2.2.3.	Chile .....	93
4.1.3.2.2.4.	Colombia .....	94
4.1.3.2.2.4.1.	Legality, the Distribution of Competences and Democracy.....	94
4.1.3.2.2.4.2.	Certainty – Reasonable Precision of the Law .....	99
4.1.3.2.2.4.3.	Legal Security .....	100
4.1.3.2.2.4.4.	Non-Retrospective Application of the Law .....	101
4.1.3.2.2.5.	Peru.....	103
4.1.3.2.3.	The Caribbean .....	104
4.1.3.2.4.	North America .....	104
4.1.3.2.4.1.	United States.....	104
4.1.3.2.4.2.	Canada .....	105

4.1.3.3.	Asia .....	105
4.1.3.3.1.	China .....	105
4.1.3.3.2.	India.....	106
4.1.3.3.3.	Israel .....	107
4.1.3.3.4.	Japan .....	108
4.1.3.4.	Europe.....	110
4.1.3.4.1.	European Union and Council of Europe .....	110
4.1.3.4.2.	Russia.....	111
4.1.3.5.	Oceania .....	112
4.1.3.5.1.	Australia .....	112
4.1.3.5.2.	New Zealand.....	113
4.2.	Proportionality.....	114
4.2.1.	The Principle .....	114
4.2.2.	Its Application in Different Regions .....	116
4.2.2.1.	Africa.....	116
4.2.2.2.	Americas.....	117
4.2.2.2.1.	The Inter-American System for the Protection of Human Rights.....	117
4.2.2.2.2.	Latin America.....	117
4.2.2.2.2.1.	Argentina .....	117
4.2.2.2.2.2.	Brazil.....	118
4.2.2.2.2.3.	Chile .....	118
4.2.2.2.2.4.	Colombia .....	119
4.2.2.2.2.4.1.	The Discretionary Powers of Law making and their Limits.....	119
4.2.2.2.2.4.2.	Strict Judicial Scrutiny for Tax Amnesties .....	120
4.2.2.2.2.4.3.	Intermediate Scrutiny in Case of Potential Inequity .....	120
4.2.2.2.2.4.4.	Low Scrutiny as the Regular Standard.....	121
4.2.2.2.2.5.	Peru.....	121
4.2.2.2.3.	The Caribbean .....	122
4.2.2.2.4.	United States.....	122
4.2.2.3.	Asia .....	123
4.2.2.3.1.	China .....	123
4.2.2.3.2.	India.....	124
4.2.2.3.3.	Israel .....	124
4.2.2.3.4.	Japan .....	127
4.2.2.4.	Europe.....	128
4.2.2.4.1.	European Union.....	128
4.2.2.4.2.	Russia.....	129
4.2.2.5.	Oceania .....	130
4.2.2.5.1.	Australia .....	130
4.2.2.5.2.	New Zealand.....	131

4.3.	Anti-Tax Avoidance and Evasion Measures Limiting Taxpayers' Rights.....	131
4.3.1.	The International Scenario.....	131
4.3.1.1.	Distinguishing Tax Planning and Tax Avoidance .....	131
4.3.1.2.	An Obligation to Counter BEPS? .....	132
4.3.1.2.1.	Problems of Definition .....	132
4.3.1.2.2.	Treaty Shopping .....	133
4.3.1.2.3.	Minimum Taxation and Controlled Foreign Company Legislation.....	134
4.3.2.	Different Regions.....	135
4.3.2.1.	Africa.....	135
4.3.2.1.1.	Different Contexts and Approaches to Abuse .....	135
4.3.2.1.2.	African Countries with Statutory GAARs.....	137
4.3.2.1.3.	South Africa.....	139
4.3.2.2.	Americas .....	141
4.3.2.2.1.	Latin America.....	141
4.3.2.2.1.1.	Argentina .....	141
4.3.2.2.1.2.	Brazil.....	141
4.3.2.2.1.3.	Chile .....	142
4.3.2.2.1.4.	Mexico.....	143
4.3.2.2.1.4.1.	Application of the Mexican GAAR.....	143
4.3.2.2.1.4.2.	Definitions in the Mexican GAAR.....	144
4.3.2.2.1.5.	Peru.....	144
4.3.2.2.2.	The Caribbean .....	145
4.3.2.2.3.	United States .....	145
4.3.2.3.	Asia.....	147
4.3.2.3.1.	China .....	147
4.3.2.3.2.	India.....	148
4.3.2.3.3.	Israel .....	149
4.3.2.3.4.	Japan .....	149
4.3.2.4.	Europe .....	150
4.3.2.4.1.	European Union .....	150
4.3.2.4.2.	Russia .....	151
4.3.2.5.	Oceania .....	152
4.3.2.5.1.	Australia .....	152
4.3.2.5.2.	New Zealand.....	153
4.4.	Fairness .....	153
4.4.1.	General Introduction.....	153
4.4.2.	Different Regions.....	155
4.4.2.1.	Africa.....	155
4.4.2.1.1.	General .....	155
4.4.2.1.2.	South Africa.....	156
4.4.2.2.	Americas .....	157
4.4.2.2.1.	The Inter-American System for the Protection of Human Rights.....	157

4.4.2.2.2.	Latin America.....	158
4.4.2.2.2.1.	Argentina .....	158
4.4.2.2.2.2.	Brazil.....	158
4.4.2.2.2.3.	Chile .....	159
4.4.2.2.2.4.	Colombia .....	160
4.4.2.2.2.5.	Mexico.....	160
4.4.2.2.2.6.	Peru.....	160
4.4.2.2.3.	United States.....	161
4.4.2.3.	Asia.....	161
4.4.2.3.1.	China .....	161
4.4.2.3.2.	India.....	162
4.4.2.3.3.	Israel .....	162
4.4.2.3.4.	Japan.....	163
4.4.2.4.	Europe .....	163
4.4.2.4.1.	European Union.....	163
4.4.2.4.1.1.	Procedural Fairness .....	164
4.4.2.4.1.2.	Fair Tax Competition.....	165
4.4.2.4.1.3.	Fair and Efficient Taxation of Corporate Profits (Fair Share) and the Problem of Tax Avoidance.....	166
4.4.2.4.2.	Russia.....	168
4.4.2.5.	Oceania .....	169
4.4.2.5.1.	Australia .....	169
4.4.2.5.2.	New Zealand.....	170
5.	Special Features of Human Rights in Taxation .....	171
5.1.	The Emergence of Taxpayer Bills of Rights .....	171
5.1.1.	Introduction .....	171
5.1.2.	Taxpayers' Bills of Rights in the Different Regions .....	173
5.1.2.1.	Africa.....	173
5.1.2.1.1.	General.....	173
5.1.2.1.2.	South Africa.....	174
5.1.2.1.3.	The Charters in Other African Countries .....	175
5.1.2.2.	Americas .....	176
5.1.2.2.1.	Latin America.....	176
5.1.2.2.1.1.	Argentina .....	176
5.1.2.2.1.2.	Brazil.....	177
5.1.2.2.1.3.	Chile .....	177
5.1.2.2.1.4.	Colombia .....	177
5.1.2.2.1.5.	Mexico.....	177
5.1.2.2.1.6.	Peru.....	178
5.1.2.2.2.	The Caribbean .....	178
5.1.2.2.3.	North America .....	179
5.1.2.2.3.1.	Canada .....	179
5.1.2.2.3.2.	United States.....	179

5.1.2.3.	Asia .....	180
5.1.2.3.1.	China .....	180
5.1.2.3.2.	India .....	181
5.1.2.3.3.	Israel .....	181
5.1.2.3.4.	Japan .....	182
5.1.2.3.5.	South Korea .....	182
5.1.2.4.	Europe .....	183
5.1.2.4.1.	European Union and its Member States .....	183
5.1.2.4.1.1.	European Union .....	183
5.1.2.4.1.2.	EU Member States .....	183
5.1.2.4.1.2.1.	Austria .....	183
5.1.2.4.1.2.2.	Belgium .....	184
5.1.2.4.1.2.3.	France .....	184
5.1.2.4.1.2.4.	Germany .....	184
5.1.2.4.1.2.5.	Italy .....	184
5.1.2.4.2.	Russia .....	185
5.1.2.4.3.	Switzerland .....	186
5.1.2.4.4.	United Kingdom .....	186
5.1.2.5.	Oceania .....	187
5.1.2.5.1.	Australia .....	187
5.1.2.5.2.	New Zealand .....	188
5.1.3.	Conclusions on Taxpayers' Bills of Rights .....	188
5.2.	Intermediaries .....	188
5.2.1.	General .....	188
5.2.2.	Different Regions .....	189
5.2.2.1.	Africa .....	189
5.2.2.2.	Americas .....	190
5.2.2.2.1.	Latin America .....	190
5.2.2.2.1.1.	Argentina .....	190
5.2.2.2.1.2.	Brazil .....	191
5.2.2.2.1.3.	Chile .....	191
5.2.2.2.1.4.	Mexico .....	191
5.2.2.2.1.5.	Peru .....	192
5.2.2.2.2.	United States .....	192
5.2.2.3.	Asia .....	193
5.2.2.3.1.	China .....	193
5.2.2.3.2.	India .....	193
5.2.2.3.3.	Israel .....	193
5.2.2.3.4.	Japan .....	194
5.2.2.4.	Europe .....	194
5.2.2.4.1.	European Union .....	194
5.2.2.4.2.	Russia .....	195
5.2.2.5.	Oceania .....	195
5.2.2.5.1.	Australia .....	195
5.2.2.5.2.	New Zealand .....	196

5.3.	Human Rights of Legal Persons.....	196
5.3.1.	Africa .....	196
5.3.1.1.	South Africa .....	196
5.3.2.	Americas.....	197
5.3.2.1.	The Inter-American System for the Protection of Human Rights .....	197
5.3.2.2.	Latin America .....	197
5.3.2.2.1.	Argentina .....	197
5.3.2.2.2.	Brazil.....	198
5.3.2.2.3.	Chile.....	198
5.3.2.2.4.	Peru.....	198
5.3.2.2.5.	United States.....	199
5.3.3.	Asia.....	199
5.3.3.1.	China .....	199
5.3.3.2.	India .....	199
5.3.3.3.	Israel.....	200
5.3.3.4.	Japan.....	200
5.3.4.	Europe.....	201
5.3.4.1.	European Union.....	201
5.3.4.2.	United Kingdom.....	202
5.3.5.	Oceania.....	202
5.3.5.1.	Australia .....	202
5.3.5.2.	New Zealand .....	202
5.4.	Classification of Human Rights in Tax Matters.....	203
5.4.1.	The Reason Underlying the Tripartite Classification .....	203
5.4.2.	Interplay between the Categories .....	204
5.4.3.	The Mainly Affected Human Rights in Tax Matters.....	205
6.	The Procedural Rights .....	206
6.1.	Access to Documents ( <i>Habeas Data</i> ).....	207
6.1.1.	General Issues.....	207
6.1.2.	The Situation in the Different Regions of the World .....	208
6.1.2.1.	Africa.....	208
6.1.2.1.1.	The African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights.....	208
6.1.2.1.2.	South Africa.....	209
6.1.2.2.	Americas .....	209
6.1.2.2.1.	The Inter-American System for the Protection of Taxpayers' Rights.....	209
6.1.2.2.2.	Latin America.....	210
6.1.2.2.2.1.	Argentina .....	210
6.1.2.2.2.2.	Brazil.....	210
6.1.2.2.2.3.	Chile .....	211
6.1.2.2.2.4.	Colombia .....	212
6.1.2.2.2.5.	Peru.....	212
6.1.2.2.3.	The Caribbean .....	213
6.1.2.2.4.	United States.....	213

6.1.2.3.	Asia .....	214
6.1.2.3.1.	China .....	214
6.1.2.3.2.	India .....	214
6.1.2.3.3.	Israel .....	215
6.1.2.3.4.	Japan .....	215
6.1.2.4.	Europe .....	217
6.1.2.4.1.	European Union .....	217
6.1.2.4.1.1.	General Issues and Sources of Law .....	218
6.1.2.4.1.2.	Right of Access to Data in the Framework of Mutual Assistance .....	219
6.1.2.4.1.2.1.	Rights in the Requesting Member State .....	220
6.1.2.4.1.2.2.	Rights in the Requested Member State .....	221
6.1.2.4.1.3.	Right of Access to Data in the Framework of MAP and Arbitration under the Dispute Resolution Directive (DRD) .....	222
6.1.2.4.2.	United Kingdom .....	224
6.1.2.4.3.	Russia .....	225
6.1.2.5.	Oceania .....	225
6.1.2.5.1.	Australia .....	225
6.1.2.5.2.	New Zealand .....	226
6.2.	Right to Be Heard .....	226
6.2.1.	General .....	226
6.2.2.	Different Regions .....	226
6.2.2.1.	Africa .....	226
6.2.2.2.	Americas .....	228
6.2.2.2.1.	The Inter-American System for the Protection of Human Rights .....	228
6.2.2.2.2.	Latin America .....	228
6.2.2.2.2.1.	Argentina .....	228
6.2.2.2.2.2.	Brazil .....	229
6.2.2.2.2.3.	Chile .....	230
6.2.2.2.2.4.	Peru .....	230
6.2.2.2.3.	The Caribbean .....	230
6.2.2.2.4.	United States .....	231
6.2.2.3.	Asia .....	231
6.2.2.3.1.	China .....	231
6.2.2.3.2.	India .....	231
6.2.2.3.3.	Israel .....	232
6.2.2.3.4.	Japan .....	232
6.2.2.4.	Europe .....	233
6.2.2.4.1.	European Union .....	233
6.2.2.4.1.1.	The Domestic Scenario .....	233
6.2.2.4.1.2.	Cross-Border Situations .....	235
6.2.2.4.2.	Russia .....	235
6.2.2.5.	Oceania .....	236

6.3.	Right to Judicial Protection .....	236
6.3.1.	General Issues .....	236
6.3.1.1.	The Domestic Scenario .....	237
6.3.1.1.1.	Access to Judicial Protection .....	237
6.3.1.1.2.	Privilege against Self-Incrimination .....	237
6.3.1.1.3.	Presumption of Innocence.....	237
6.3.1.1.4.	Independent Tribunal .....	238
6.3.1.1.5.	Fair Trial.....	238
6.3.1.2.	Cross-Border Situations.....	239
6.3.2.	The Right to Judicial Protection in Different Regions.....	241
6.3.2.1.	Africa.....	241
6.3.2.1.1.	General.....	241
6.3.2.1.2.	South Africa.....	242
6.3.2.2.	Americas.....	245
6.3.2.2.1.	The Inter-American System for the Protection of Human Rights.....	245
6.3.2.2.1.1.	Legal Sources of the Access to Judicial Protection in the Inter-American System.....	245
6.3.2.2.1.2.	Independent and Impartial Tribunal.....	246
6.3.2.2.1.3.	Fair Trial.....	246
6.3.2.2.2.	Latin America.....	247
6.3.2.2.2.1.	Argentina .....	247
6.3.2.2.2.2.	Brazil.....	248
6.3.2.2.2.2.1.	General.....	248
6.3.2.2.2.2.2.	Administrative Review and Judicial Protection.....	249
6.3.2.2.2.2.3.	Right to Judicial Protection in Cross- Border Situations .....	251
6.3.2.2.2.3.3.	Chile .....	252
6.3.2.2.2.3.1.	Reform of Judicial Protection.....	252
6.3.2.2.2.3.2.	Right to Judicial Protection in Cross-Border Situations.....	252
6.3.2.2.2.4.	Colombia .....	253
6.3.2.2.2.5.	Mexico.....	254
6.3.2.2.2.6.	Peru.....	255
6.3.2.2.3.	United States.....	256
6.3.2.2.4.	Canada.....	257
6.3.2.3.	Asia.....	257
6.3.2.3.1.	China .....	257
6.3.2.3.2.	India.....	258
6.3.2.3.3.	Israel .....	260

6.3.2.3.4. Japan .....	261
6.3.2.3.4.1. The System of Reinvestigation, Reconsideration and Lawsuits .....	261
6.3.2.3.4.2. Right to Judicial Protection in Cross-Border Situations.....	262
6.3.2.4. Europe .....	263
6.3.2.4.1. European Union.....	263
6.3.2.4.1.1. Legal Sources of the Access to Judicial Protection in the European Region .....	263
6.3.2.4.1.2. Domestic Situations.....	264
6.3.2.4.1.2.1. Independent and Impartial Tribunal.....	265
6.3.2.4.1.2.2. Within a Reasonable Time .....	266
6.3.2.4.1.2.3. Fair Trial .....	267
6.3.2.4.1.2.4. Use of Evidence Obtained.....	270
6.3.2.4.1.3. Right to Judicial Protection in Cross-Border Situations.....	271
6.3.2.4.1.3.1. General Issues.....	271
6.3.2.4.1.3.2. Right to Rule of Law Protection in Connection with Mutual Assistance in the Exchange of Information.....	271
6.3.2.4.1.3.3. Taxpayers' Rights in Mutual Agreement Procedures and Arbitration .....	275
6.3.2.4.1.3.4. Mutual Agreement Procedures, Arbitration and the CJEU ( <i>Achmea</i> ) .....	277
6.3.2.4.1.3.5. Baseball Arbitration and Fair Trial .....	279
6.3.2.4.1.3.6. Conclusions and Way Forward .....	280
6.3.2.4.2. Russia.....	281
6.3.2.4.3. Switzerland .....	285
6.3.2.4.4. United Kingdom .....	286
6.3.2.5. Oceania .....	287
6.3.2.5.1. Australia .....	287
6.3.2.5.1.1. Judicial Review.....	287
6.3.2.5.1.2. Use of Evidence Obtained through Mutual Assistance.....	288

6.3.2.5.2. New Zealand.....	290
6.3.2.5.2.1. The Domestic Scenario .....	290
6.3.2.5.2.2. Judicial Protection in Cross-Border Situations .....	291
6.4. Equivalent Measures for Protection of Taxpayers' Rights, Notably Ombudspersons.....	292
6.4.1. Tax Ombudspersons as Equivalent Protection Mechanism .....	292
6.4.1.1. General.....	292
6.4.1.2. Tax Ombudspersons in the Different Regions.....	293
6.4.1.2.1. Africa.....	293
6.4.1.2.1.1. General.....	293
6.4.1.2.1.2. South Africa .....	294
6.4.1.2.1.3. Other African Countries .....	296
6.4.1.2.2. Americas .....	296
6.4.1.2.2.1. Latin America .....	296
6.4.1.2.2.1.1. Argentina .....	296
6.4.1.2.2.1.2. Brazil.....	296
6.4.1.2.2.1.3. Chile.....	297
6.4.1.2.2.1.4. Colombia.....	297
6.4.1.2.2.1.5. Mexico .....	297
6.4.1.2.2.1.6. Peru.....	298
6.4.1.2.2.2. The Caribbean .....	298
6.4.1.2.2.3. United States.....	298
6.4.1.2.3. Asia .....	299
6.4.1.2.3.1. China.....	299
6.4.1.2.3.2. India.....	300
6.4.1.2.3.3. Israel.....	300
6.4.1.2.3.4. Japan.....	300
6.4.1.2.4. Europe .....	300
6.4.1.2.4.1. The European Union and its Member States.....	300
6.4.1.2.4.1.1. Austria .....	300
6.4.1.2.4.1.2. France .....	301
6.4.1.2.4.1.3. Italy .....	301
6.4.1.2.4.1.4. Spain .....	301
6.4.1.2.4.2. Russia .....	302
6.4.1.2.4.3. United Kingdom .....	302
6.4.1.2.5. Oceania.....	303
6.4.1.2.5.1. Australia.....	303
6.4.1.2.5.2. New Zealand .....	303
6.4.1.3. Conclusions on Tax Ombudspersons .....	304
6.4.2. Other Equivalent Protection Mechanisms.....	304
6.5. Conclusions on Procedural Rights.....	304
6.5.1. Introduction.....	304
6.5.2. Access to Documents ( <i>Habeas Data</i> ) .....	305
6.5.3. Right to be Heard ( <i>Audi Alteram Partem</i> ) .....	306
6.5.4. Right to Judicial Protection.....	307
6.5.5. Alternative Measures .....	309

7.	Taxpayers' Rights Related to Sanctions .....	311
7.1.	General.....	311
7.2.	Criminal and Administrative Contraventions.....	312
7.2.1.	Criminal Contraventions .....	312
7.2.2.	Administrative Contraventions .....	313
7.2.3.	Sanctions, Penalties or Both? .....	314
7.3.	Different Regions.....	315
7.3.1.	Africa .....	315
7.3.1.1.	South Africa .....	315
7.3.2.	Americas.....	317
7.3.2.1.	The Inter-American System for the Protection of Human Rights .....	317
7.3.2.2.	Latin America .....	318
7.3.2.2.1.	Argentina .....	318
7.3.2.2.2.	Brazil.....	319
7.3.2.2.3.	Chile.....	320
7.3.2.2.4.	Colombia.....	321
7.3.2.2.4.1.	Criminal Sanctions.....	321
7.3.2.2.4.2.	Administrative Penalties.....	322
7.3.2.2.5.	Mexico.....	323
7.3.2.2.6.	Peru.....	323
7.3.2.3.	The Caribbean.....	325
7.3.2.4.	United States.....	326
7.3.3.	Asia.....	327
7.3.3.1.	China .....	327
7.3.3.2.	India .....	328
7.3.3.3.	Israel.....	329
7.3.3.4.	Japan.....	330
7.3.4.	Europe.....	331
7.3.4.1.	European Union.....	331
7.3.4.1.1.	Austria .....	336
7.3.4.1.2.	Germany.....	337
7.3.4.1.3.	Greece.....	338
7.3.4.1.4.	Italy .....	338
7.3.4.1.5.	Malta.....	339
7.3.4.2.	Russia .....	340
7.3.4.3.	United Kingdom .....	341
7.3.5.	Oceania .....	341
7.3.5.1.	Australia.....	341
7.3.5.2.	New Zealand .....	342
7.4.	Conclusions on Sanctions .....	342
8.	Substantive Rights.....	345
8.1.	Equality.....	345
8.1.1.	Introductory Remarks .....	345
8.1.2.	Equality in Different Regions .....	348
8.1.2.1.	Africa.....	348
8.1.2.2.	Americas.....	349

8.1.2.2.1.	The Inter-American System for the Protection of Human Rights .....	349
8.1.2.2.2.	Latin America.....	349
8.1.2.2.2.1.	Argentina .....	349
8.1.2.2.2.2.	Brazil.....	350
8.1.2.2.2.2.1.	Equal Treatment of Taxpayers.....	351
8.1.2.2.2.2.2.	Competition Neutrality.....	351
8.1.2.2.2.3.	Chile .....	352
8.1.2.2.2.4.	Colombia .....	353
8.1.2.2.2.5.	Peru.....	354
8.1.2.2.3.	United States.....	355
8.1.2.3.	Asia .....	356
8.1.2.3.1.	China .....	356
8.1.2.3.2.	India.....	356
8.1.2.3.3.	Israel .....	356
8.1.2.3.4.	Japan .....	358
8.1.2.4.	Europe.....	358
8.1.2.4.1.	European Union.....	358
8.1.2.4.2.	Council of Europe.....	360
8.1.2.4.3.	Russia.....	361
8.1.2.5.	Oceania .....	362
8.1.2.5.1.	Australia .....	362
8.1.2.5.2.	New Zealand.....	362
8.1.3.	Neutrality as a Principle of International Taxation.....	363
8.1.4.	Ability to Pay.....	364
8.1.4.1.	General.....	364
8.1.4.2.	Different Regions.....	366
8.1.4.2.1.	Africa.....	366
8.1.4.2.2.	Americas .....	367
8.1.4.2.2.1.	Latin America .....	367
8.1.4.2.2.1.1.	Argentina .....	367
8.1.4.2.2.1.2.	Brazil.....	368
8.1.4.2.2.1.3.	Chile.....	369
8.1.4.2.2.1.4.	Colombia.....	369
8.1.4.2.2.1.5.	Mexico.....	370
8.1.4.2.2.1.6.	Peru.....	371
8.1.4.2.2.2.	United States.....	371
8.1.4.2.3.	Asia .....	372
8.1.4.2.3.1.	China.....	372
8.1.4.2.3.2.	India.....	372
8.1.4.2.3.3.	Israel .....	373
8.1.4.2.3.4.	Japan.....	373
8.1.4.2.4.	Europe .....	373
8.1.4.2.4.1.	European Union.....	373
8.1.4.2.4.2.	Russia .....	375
8.1.4.2.5.	Oceania.....	376

8.1.5.	Equity.....	376
8.1.6.	The Different Expressions of the Principle of Equality in Tax Law .....	378
8.1.6.1.	Introductory Remarks.....	378
8.1.6.2.	The General Principle of Equality .....	378
8.1.6.3.	Ability to Pay .....	379
8.1.6.4.	Competition Neutrality .....	380
8.1.6.5.	Tax Justice, Fairness, Equity.....	380
8.2.	Data Protection Rights.....	381
8.2.1.	General Issues Regarding Data Protection in Tax Matters.....	381
8.2.2.	Taxpayers' Data Protection Rights in Different Regions.....	382
8.2.2.1.	Africa.....	382
8.2.2.2.	Americas .....	384
8.2.2.2.1.	The Inter-American System for the Protection of Human Rights.....	384
8.2.2.2.2.	Latin America.....	384
8.2.2.2.2.1.	The Andean Community.....	384
8.2.2.2.2.2.	Argentina .....	384
8.2.2.2.2.3.	Brazil.....	385
8.2.2.2.2.4.	Chile .....	385
8.2.2.2.2.5.	Peru.....	386
8.2.2.2.2.6.	Mexico.....	386
8.2.2.2.3.	The Caribbean .....	387
8.2.2.2.4.	United States.....	387
8.2.2.3.	Asia .....	389
8.2.2.3.1.	China .....	389
8.2.2.3.2.	India.....	390
8.2.2.3.3.	Israel .....	390
8.2.2.3.4.	Japan .....	391
8.2.2.4.	Europe .....	392
8.2.2.4.1.	European Union and Council of Europe .....	392
8.2.2.4.1.1.	Legal Sources.....	393
8.2.2.4.1.2.	Taxpayers .....	396
8.2.2.4.1.3.	Tax Professionals and Intermediaries .....	400
8.2.2.4.2.	Russia.....	401
8.2.2.5.	Oceania .....	402
8.2.2.5.1.	Australia .....	402
8.2.2.5.2.	New Zealand.....	403
8.2.2.5.2.1.	Protection against Unreasonable Searches and Seizures.....	403
8.2.2.5.2.2.	Privacy and Data Protection .....	404
8.2.2.5.2.3.	Tax Secrecy .....	404
8.2.3.	The Impact of Tax Transparency on Data Protection – Cross-Border Situations .....	405
8.2.3.1.	General.....	405
8.2.3.2.	Mutual Assistance in Tax Matters.....	406
8.2.3.2.1.	General Introduction and Legal Sources .....	406

8.2.3.2.2. The Impact of Mutual Assistance on Taxpayers' Rights .....	408
8.2.3.3. Tax Transparency and Mutual Assistance in the Different Regions .....	410
8.2.3.3.1. Africa .....	410
8.2.3.3.2. Americas .....	411
8.2.3.3.2.1. Latin America .....	411
8.2.3.3.2.1.1. Argentina .....	411
8.2.3.3.2.1.2. Brazil .....	412
8.2.3.3.2.1.3. Chile .....	412
8.2.3.3.2.1.4. Peru .....	413
8.2.3.3.2.1.5. Mexico .....	414
8.2.3.3.2.2. The Caribbean .....	414
8.2.3.3.2.3. United States .....	414
8.2.3.3.3. Asia .....	415
8.2.3.3.3.1. China .....	415
8.2.3.3.3.2. India .....	416
8.2.3.3.3.3. Israel .....	416
8.2.3.3.3.4. Japan .....	418
8.2.3.3.4. Europe .....	418
8.2.3.3.4.1. European Union .....	418
8.2.3.3.4.1.1. Standards of Transparency .....	418
8.2.3.3.4.1.2. Strict Regime for the Exchange of Data Other than Tax Data .....	419
8.2.3.3.4.1.3. Exchange of Tax Data .....	420
8.2.3.3.4.2. Russia .....	422
8.2.3.3.4.3. Switzerland .....	423
8.2.3.3.5. Oceania .....	425
8.2.3.3.5.1. Australia .....	425
8.2.3.3.5.2. New Zealand .....	425
8.2.4. Conclusion on Data Protection .....	426
8.3. Rights and Obligations of Professionals and Intermediaries .....	428
8.3.1. General Introduction .....	428
8.3.2. Different Regions .....	430
8.3.2.1. Africa .....	430
8.3.2.2. Americas .....	430
8.3.2.2.1. Latin America .....	430
8.3.2.2.1.1. Argentina .....	430
8.3.2.2.1.2. Brazil .....	431
8.3.2.2.1.3. Chile .....	432
8.3.2.2.1.4. Mexico .....	433
8.3.2.2.1.5. Peru .....	433
8.3.2.2.2. United States .....	434
8.3.2.3. Asia .....	435
8.3.2.3.1. China .....	435

8.3.2.3.2. India.....	436
8.3.2.3.3. Israel .....	437
8.3.2.3.4. Japan .....	437
8.3.2.4. Europe .....	438
8.3.2.4.1. European Union.....	438
8.3.2.4.2. Russia.....	441
8.3.2.5. Oceania .....	442
8.3.2.5.1. Australia.....	442
8.3.2.5.2. New Zealand.....	442
8.3.2.5.2.1. Legal Professional Privilege.....	442
8.3.2.5.2.2. Non-disclosure Right Regarding Tax Advice Documents.....	443
8.3.3. Conclusion on Professional Rights and Obligations .....	443
8.3.3.1. Taxpayers and Intermediaries .....	443
8.3.3.2. Professional Rights in the Era of Tax Transparency.....	445
8.4. Taxpayers' Property Rights.....	445
8.4.1. Introduction.....	445
8.4.2. Different Regions.....	446
8.4.2.1. Africa.....	446
8.4.2.2. Americas .....	448
8.4.2.2.1. The Inter-American System for the Protection of Human Rights .....	448
8.4.2.2.2. Latin America.....	448
8.4.2.2.2.1. Argentina.....	448
8.4.2.2.2.2. Brazil.....	449
8.4.2.2.2.3. Chile .....	449
8.4.2.2.2.4. Colombia .....	450
8.4.2.2.2.4.1. Three Paradigmatic Cases .....	450
8.4.2.2.2.4.2. Confiscatory Taxation .....	451
8.4.2.2.5. Mexico.....	453
8.4.2.2.6. Peru.....	453
8.4.2.2.3. The Caribbean .....	454
8.4.2.2.4. United States.....	454
8.4.2.3. Asia .....	455
8.4.2.3.1. China .....	455
8.4.2.3.2. India .....	455
8.4.2.3.3. Israel .....	456
8.4.2.3.4. Japan .....	457
8.4.2.4. Europe .....	458
8.4.2.4.1. Council of Europe.....	458
8.4.2.4.2. European Union.....	462
8.4.2.4.3. Russia.....	463
8.4.2.4.3.1. Claims as Property.....	463
8.4.2.4.3.2. Taxpayers' Liability for 'Property Damages' to the State Budget.....	463

8.4.2.5.	Oceania .....	465
8.4.2.5.1.	Australia.....	465
8.4.2.5.2.	New Zealand.....	465
8.4.3.	Conclusion on Taxpayers' Property Rights.....	465
8.4.3.1.	Prohibition on Confiscatory Taxation .....	466
8.4.3.2.	Protection of Foreign Property.....	467

**PART III**  
**AN INTERNATIONAL TAX REGIME CONTAINING**  
**MINIMUM STANDARDS FOR THE PROTECTION**  
**OF TAXPAYERS' RIGHTS**

9.	The Emergence of an International Tax Regime.....	471
9.1.	Nexus Requirement as Customary International Law .....	471
9.2.	A Convention-based Regime.....	472
9.3.	The Interaction of International Conventions and Domestic Law.....	474
9.4.	The Importance of Soft Law in International Taxation – Impact of the OECD .....	475
9.4.1.	The Role of Soft Law .....	475
9.4.2.	The International Institutional Framework of International Taxation .....	476
9.4.3.	OECD Model Conventions and Commentaries .....	477
9.4.4.	The 2017 Transfer Pricing Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises and Tax Administrations .....	478
9.4.5.	The 4th International Guidelines of the OECD on Value Added Tax and Goods and Services Tax ('VAT/GST-Guidelines') .....	478
9.5.	The International Financial Reporting Standards.....	479
9.6.	'Soft Law' in Customs and Value Added Tax Law of the EU .....	480
9.7.	Measures against Harmful Tax Practices.....	481
9.7.1.	Standard of Global Fiscal Transparency.....	482
9.7.2.	The Arm's-Length Standard .....	482
9.7.3.	CFC Legislation .....	484
9.8.	Investment Law and Customary Taxpayers' Rights: The Prohibition of Indirect Expropriation, the National Treatment and Fair and Equitable Treatment Standards .....	484
9.8.1.	Expropriation through Taxation .....	485
9.8.2.	National Treatment .....	487
9.8.3.	Conclusions on Investment Law and Taxpayers' Rights .....	489
10.	International Minimum Standards for the Protection of Taxpayers' Rights.....	490
10.1.	The Need for Global Minimum Standards.....	490
10.1.1.	Tax Law as Public International Law: Coordinated Bilateralism.....	490
10.1.2.	Individuals as Subjects of International Law .....	491
10.2.	The General Principles of Taxpayers' Rights Protection .....	492
10.2.1.	The Rule of Law .....	493
10.2.2.	Proportionality .....	493

10.2.3. The Fight against Abusive and Fraudulent Practices.....	493
10.2.4. Fairness.....	494
10.3. Procedural Rights .....	495
10.3.1. Access to Documents ( <i>Habeas Data</i> ) .....	495
10.3.2. Right to Be Heard .....	496
10.3.3. Right to Judicial Protection.....	496
10.3.4. Equivalent Measures for the Protection of Taxpayers' Rights, Notably Ombudspersons.....	497
10.4. Taxpayers' Rights Related to Sanctions.....	497
10.5. Substantive Rights .....	498
10.5.1. General Issues.....	498
10.5.2. Equality and Related Principles.....	498
10.5.3. Data Protection.....	499
10.5.3.1. Recent Developments.....	499
10.5.3.2. The Clash between Individual Rights and Collective Rights in the Realm of Data Protection .....	500
10.5.3.3. Data Protection in a Domestic Tax Context .....	501
10.5.3.4. Data Protection in Cross-Border Tax Scenarios.....	501
10.5.3.5. Automatic Exchange of Information for Tax Purposes .....	502
10.5.4. Taxpayers' Property Rights .....	504
10.6. Conclusion .....	504
11. Proposed International Instruments .....	505
11.1. Hard and Soft Law Approach.....	505
11.1.1. Soft Law .....	505
11.1.2. Hard Law – Treaty .....	506
11.2. The International Charter of Taxpayers' Fundamental Rights .....	508
11.2.1. The Methodology .....	508
11.2.2. The Content.....	509
11.2.2.1. General Issues .....	509
11.2.2.2. Subjective Scope.....	510
11.2.2.3. Objective Scope.....	510
11.2.2.4. Cross-Border Situations.....	511
11.2.2.5. Interpretation.....	512
11.2.2.6. International Minimum Standard of Legal Protection.....	513
11.2.2.7. Substantive Rights .....	514
11.2.2.8. Procedural Rights .....	515
11.2.2.9. Rights Related to Sanctions.....	516
11.3. Guidelines for Tax Authorities.....	517
<i>List of Countries' Official Court Names</i> .....	519
<i>Bibliography</i> .....	523
<i>Index</i> .....	541